HPCRESOLUTION TOWNSHIP OF NEPTUNE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION RESOLUTION OF MEMORIALIZATION MONMOUTH COUNTY, NEW JERSEY DENIAL OF NEW DOOR FENESTRATION

Denied: May 14, 2024

IN THE MATTER OF: JOHN AND RAMONA BANNAYAN
(14 OCEAN PATHWAY)

APPLICATION NO.: HPC2024-022

WHEREAS, John and Ramona Bannayan (the "Applicant") have applied to the Township of Neptune Historic Preservation Commission (the "Commission") seeking to add a French doors (new fenestration) to the existing accessory garage structure pursuant to Sections 900-914 of the Township of Neptune Land Development Ordinance for lands known and designated as Block 128, Lot 4, on the official Tax Map of the Township of Neptune, and more commonly known as 14 Ocean Pathway, Ocean Grove, New Jersey 07756 (the "Property"); and

WHEREAS, a complete application has been filed, the fees as required by Township Ordinance have been paid, proof of service and publication of notice is required by law has been furnished and determined to be in proper order, and it otherwise appears that the jurisdiction and powers of the Commission have been properly invoked and exercised; and

WHEREAS, a public hearing was held remotely using the Zoom platform on May 14, 2024, at which time testimony and the exhibits referenced below were presented on behalf of the Applicant and all interested parties having had an opportunity to be heard; and

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED the Commission makes the following findings of fact based on evidence presented at its public hearing at which a record was made:

- 1. The Applicant is seeking approval to add French doors (new fenestration) to the existing accessory garage structure on the Property.
- 2. The subject property is located within the HDR-O Historic District Oceanfront with the residential dwelling constructed in 1879, which is designated as an "Key Structure" as defined in the Historic District's Design Guidelines for Residential Structures ("Design Guidelines"). The accessory garage structure was added by 1930.
- 3. Ramona Bannayan appeared and testified concerning her reasons for wanting to install French doors to the side of the garage structure, requiring a new fenestration be cut into the wall. The garage is already served by both a man door and a vehicle door; the French doors on

the side would be a decorative element to further dress up that side of the structure, facing the residence.

- 4. The Commission expressed concern that the application was not consistent with the Design Guidelines, particularly page 8 (maintain intent of the original design). The Commission determined that the proposal, while aesthetically appealing to the homeowner, was not historically appropriate.
 - 5. There were no members of the public who expressed an interest in the application.

NOW, THEREFORE, THE COMMISSION makes the following conclusions of law based upon the foregoing findings of fact:

- 1. The Applicant proposes to add, for purely aesthetic purposes, new French doors (new fenestration) to the side of an existing accessory garage structure already served by two other doorways.
- 2. The Commission concludes the addition of French doors, requiring a new fenestration, is historically inappropriate and inconsistent with requirements found on page 8 of the Design Guidelines. A Certificate of Appropriateness is therefore denied.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, by the Historic Preservation Commission of the Township of Neptune on this 14th day of May, 2024 that the Certificate of Appropriateness application No. HPC2024-022 for the addition of French doors along the side of an existing accessory garage structure serving a Key residential structure located at Block 128, Lot 4, 14 Ocean Pathway, Ocean Grove, New Jersey, is DENIED pursuant to Section 900-914 of the Township of Neptune Land Development Ordinance.

NEPHPC-244 John And Ramona Bannayan (14 Ocean Pathway) Resolution New Door Fenestration (HPC202(3578087.1)