18 Embury Avenue (07 February 2023Tech Review with Lucinda Heinlein and Jeffery Rudell

We spoke by Zoom to Janet, the homeowner and Bill Gannon, her contractor. The conditions on the west and south elevation of her house continue to deteriorate. Having originally proposed, and been granted permission to replace the deteriorated cedar clapboard on those two elevations, she came before the full commission on 8 November to propose using Hardie Board instead of cedar clapboard. Her reasons included the high cost of cedar.

A review of the recording of the 8 November 2022 meeting confirmed that commissioners expressed concern that the change in material would result in the loss of the historic woven corners of the original clapboard (Deborah Osepchuk). It was noted that the condition report on the siding, prepared by Jenny Shafer and Joe Wierzbinsky, indicated that the condition of clapboard on the east and north elevations was excellent. As such, only "restoration" would be permitted on those two elevations.

Commissioner Kurt Cavano noted that mitering Hardie might solve the problem but cautioned that it would be a difficult thing to accomplish.

There was also discussion of how the existing decorative frieze might be treated. Commissioners did not appear receptive to the applicants proposed scope of work.

The applicant, Janet, was offered the opportunity to have members vote on the proposed use of Hardie Board on the south and west elevation only OR to postpone a vote until she had time to discuss a possible solution with her contractor.

The application was postponed.

Janet and Bill came to Tech today and again proposed use of Hardie Board on the south and west elevation (save for the decorative shakes on those elevations, which will be restored). They acknowledged that using Hardie Board would entail adding corner boards to the structure (and eliminating the historic woven corners currently articulated on the building).

They further proposed replacing additional clapboard on the second and third? floor (east elevation) to create a consistent "look".

The applicant is welcome to amend her existing application to indicate precisely where she proposes the use of Hardie Board, and where such material would require the addition of corner boards. However, proposals for Hardie on locations other than the south and west elevation are unlikely to be persuasive to Commissioners without evidence that counters the condition report already prepared by Ms. Shafer and Mr. Wierzbinsky.

PENDING

Proposed Note from Heather Kepler to Bill Gannon and Janet
Dear Ms and Mr. Gannon:
After meeting with you by Zoom on Tuesday, HPC members reviewed the recording from the November 8, 2022, meeting of the full Commission. At that meeting your proposal to replace deteriorated historic cedar clapboard on the west and south elevation of the dwelling at 18 Embury Avenue, with Hardie Board was discussed. Members voiced their concerns over your proposal and the possible loss of historic elements such as woven clapboard corners. After much discussion you were offered the option to postpone a vote on your proposal until you and your contractor could discuss this matter further. At yesterday's Zoom meeting, you indicated you would like to proceed with your proposal to use Hardie Board. In order to reschedule this application to come before the Commission, please provide documentation (photos and/or drawings) indicating precisely where you propose to use Hardie, any and all new corner boards and their dimensions, and all areas of existing historic clapboard and decorative shakes and friezes you intend to retain and restore.
Please keep in mind members will likely refer to the prior condition report prepared by Ms. Shafer and Mr. Wierzbinsky when considering your amended application.
Please forward me sets of all relevant documentation related to your application, along with an amended narrative outlining the entire scope of the proposed work. As soon as I receive this material, I will schedule you for the next available meeting.
Sincerely,
Heather Kepler HPC Administrator